

Building Spiritual Capital through Language Teaching: Analysis of State-Mandated Elementary Language Textbooks in Pakistan

Ashar Johnson Khokhar^{a,*}

Received : 11 July 2023
Revised : 30 November 2023
Accepted : 21 December 2023
DOI : 10.26822/iejee.2024.329

^{a,*} **Corresponding Author:** Ashar Johnson Khokhar,
Forman Christian College (A Chartered University),
Lahor, Pakistan.
E-mail: asharkhokhar@fccollege.edu.pk
ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3964-819X>

Abstract

Pakistan has constantly been in the news since the September 9, 2001, attack in New York, USA, and its education system and curriculum have seen a lot of interest from academics, researchers, and civil society organizations, both locally and globally. These researchers explored many aspects such as the concept of Jihad and its connection with violence against religious minorities, the construction of 'Us' and 'Them', the national, religious, and cultural identity but the development, promotion, and preservation of spiritual capital (SC) remained unexplored. This study was undertaken to take stock of the SC considered worthwhile to be preserved and promoted through language textbooks prepared for elementary school children by the Government of Pakistan. The study used a qualitative interpretive/constructivist research paradigm and chose qualitative content analysis as the data analysis method. The data for this study was taken from language textbooks (12 English and 12 Urdu) and semi-structured interview data, collected using a focus group discussion data collection strategy. This study found a very strong link between pupils' SC and the stories presented to them in the language textbooks showing the rootedness of pupils' SC in Islam, its teachings, and history. The study also showed pupils struggling to modify and expand their SC by including the global SC perspective in their already constructed set of SC. This study recommends that the textbook authorities should make the language textbooks' content inclusive and add global stories emphasizing universal SC.

Keywords:

Spiritual Capital; Language Textbooks, Pakistan, Islam, Elementary Education



Copyright ©
www.iejee.com
ISSN: 1307-9298

© 2022 Published by KURA Education & Publishing. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license. (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)

Introduction

Spirituality is innate but it can also be developed, cultivated, and capitalized making it a rich resource for human development that would benefit and develop society. The question of how to make spirituality an asset just like capital and human assets contributing to creating wealth has been puzzling many academics and researchers from social sciences, humanities, business, and economics domains and created immense interest resulting in the evolution

of Spiritual Capital (SC) as a separate research field (Palmer & Wong, 2013). It is founded on both religious experiences, and a-religious experiences and the “spiritual in human beings makes us ask why we are doing what we are doing and makes us seek some fundamentally better way of doing it. It makes us want our lives and enterprises to make a difference” (Zohar & Marshall, 2004, p. 29). Malloch (2010) defined it as “the fund of beliefs, examples and commitments that are transmitted from generation to generation through a religious tradition, and which attach people to the transcendental source of human happiness” (cited in Malloch, 2014, p. 463). A detailed study on SC by Gràcia (2012) traced the evolution of different definitions of SC and categorized them into three groups, first rooted in ‘religion and the concept of God’, second pagan embedded ‘concept of good and evil’ and third values-based, ‘an instrument of neutral business intentionality’.

Evolution of the terms ‘Capital’, ‘Social Capital’ and ‘Spiritual Capital’

The understanding and definition of the term ‘capital’ has gone through an evolutionary process and humans have constructed and reconstructed different meanings and definitions of this term over centuries. The word ‘Capital’ (a Late Latin word based on *caput* = head), was understood as head-counting [of cattle]; later it was considered as the financial asset of a company and from there it developed to understating different aspects of society such as religious, spiritual, social and cultural assets of a society. Braudel (1992) in his book ‘Civilization and Capitalism’ traced the use of the term ‘capital’ to Italy in 1211 in the sense of the ‘assets of a trading firm’ and over time it was referred to as the ‘money capital of a firm or of a merchant.’ Fisher (1896, 1904) in his research found the present-day understanding of the term capital to an Italian source of 1612 that referred to capital ‘as a principal advanced as a quantity of money’; he also found its use in a French source of 1694 that referred to capital as the ‘principal of a debt.’ A book on accounting in England in 1635 defined capital as “the capitall which each partner of a joint company promiseth to bring in” (Cannan, 1921, p. 471). The Bank of England’s 1697 Act of Parliament refers to it as the “principal” and the “said capital stock” of the company” (p. 473). The sources as early as 1730, 1750 and 1759 referred to it as a “sum of money advanced by a trading company” or “the money which a merchant first brings into trade on his own account” (Fisher, 1904, p. 393). The ‘monetary’ meaning of capital became the dominant understanding by the eighteenth century and it was further elaborated by Adam Smith and other Economists such as David Ricardo, Thomas Malthus, and John Stuart Mill.

It was also noted that “every definition of capital has been erected on the unquestioned assumption that

the problem was one in the classification of wealth”, as writers separated “wealth into capital and non-capital” (Fisher, 1896, pp. 513-514). The concept of capital became interlinked with wealth, ‘stock of wealth’, ‘stock of things’, ‘flow of wealth’, ‘flow of goods’, ‘people who produced goods’, ‘movement of people who produced goods’, ‘capability of people who produce goods’, ‘raw material used to produce goods’, ‘revenue generated through a certain economic activity’ etc. (Braudel, 1992). The world market kept on creating capital even during the war times, which has been a continuous occurrence since humans started competing against each other. The Greeks, the Romans, the Egyptians, Christians and Muslims despite fighting against their enemies “merchant vessels sailed across it every day” (Braudel, 1992, p. 22), an incessant economic activity to produce and accumulate capital. With time, it was realized that the economic theories have failed to explain economic growth and development and explained only a part of the development story. The oversimplification of the economic development process by economists was criticized by economic social scientists for they believed that social and cultural values have also contributed to economic development (Fukuyama, 2001; Landes, 2000; Sen, 1999). The term ‘social capital’ appeared in Marx and Marshall’s works (Marshall, 1920; Marx, 1976, 1978, 1981) but it was used to refer to “national aggregates of productive assets or wealth” called public wealth but it was also observed that this concept of “social capital is but a mischievous name for national wealth” (Fetter, 1927, p. 156).

The second half of the twentieth century saw a shift in this understanding of capital adding social and political dimensions to it which generated an enormous interest and debate amongst academics about the role and value of social capital in the development of a society. Bourdieu (1986) explained it as “... the sum of the actual or potential resources that are linked to the possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition—in other words, to membership in a group” (p. 248). Another influential academic Putnam’s (1995) perspective encompassed the political perspective in social capital, he argued that “... ‘social capital’ refers to features of social organization such as networks, norms, and social trust that facilitate coordination and cooperation for mutual benefit” (Putnam, 1995, p. 67). A preview of the current literature on social capital, compiled in an edited volume by the World Bank, presented the following ideas about social capital, “the shared knowledge, understandings, norms, rules, and expectations about patterns of interactions that groups of individuals bring to a recurrent activity” (Ostrom, 2000, p. 176) and “accumulation of various types of social, psychological, cultural, cognitive, institutional, and related assets that increase the amount (or probability) of mutually beneficial cooperative behavior” (Uphoff, 2000, p. 216).

SC is a sub-set of social capital having roots in and shaped by attachment to a particular religious tradition and culture (Finke, 2003; Fuller, 2009), effects of being engaged in the spiritual and religious practices, beliefs, networks, and institutions. It is also developing as an independent area of study, becoming a tangible concept as well as an abstract idea. The scholars consider SC an important aspect of human beings irrespective of where they live, their religious affiliation or lack of it and their cultural, national and linguistic identity. Rima (2012) called it an altruistic concept, having an intrinsic value, invested for the sole purpose of benefiting other than the one who has the capital, having self-generating quality. Lucey (2019) interpreted SC as generated, constructed and accumulated through a process of reconciling the inwardly and outwardly aspects of spirituality.

The existing research on SC connected it to religion and religious teachings and its impact on SC, be it Buddhism (Barker, 2007; Borup, 2019; Hardie, 2018), Christianity (O'Sullivan & Flanagan, 2012, 2016; Vasconcelos, 2020), Islam (Golparvar, Darayi, & Khayyatan, 2015; Hefner, 2010), Hinduism (Budiasni, Ayuni, & Trisnadewi, 2019; Limacher, 2019; Sujana, Darmawan, & Dasim Budimansyah, 2021) or other religious traditions. The researchers have also looked at the SC and its link with economic development (Boettke, 2010; Keller & Helfenbein, 2008), and leadership and management especially in the finance, economics and business areas and how SC influence leadership and management skills (Middlebrooks & Noghiu, 2010; Stokes, Baker, & Lichy, 2016). Different definitions and perspectives have viewed SC as an orientation, a disposition and a path shaping the practices and procedures of individuals, groups, and organizations, creating a framework to further nurture SC.

There is very little research on Islamic capital and the research available is mostly on the economic development and efficiency and ethical business practices and values and how SC affects the Islamic concept of business, development and economics (Dsouli, Khan, & Kakabadse, 2012; Fitzgibbon; Golparvar et al., 2015; Sardar, Ryandono, & Ratnasari, 2018). These studies highlighted the Islamic teachings supporting the idea of the creation and accumulation of Islamic SC. It was presented as unique and different from the SC accumulated by non-Muslim societies and other faiths. It was noted that to understand Islamic SC one must pay "attention to the cultural and ideological content" because "social and SC, culture matters, and matters deeply" reinforcing Hefner's idea suggesting that SC "is as much an effect of culture and ideas as it is networks and trust" (2010, p. 193).

There are not many studies that focus on Pakistan and the SC of young Pakistanis. This study is undertaken with the sole purpose of exploring the SC constructed,

promoted, and accumulated by the adolescents who are in schools studying the state-mandated textbooks of English and Urdu, two core subjects for all children and adolescents till they complete their secondary education.

SC, Education, Schools, and Curriculum

Wrong noted that "our education is what is left when we may have forgotten most of the facts which we have learned" (1924, p. 23) and there have been two opposing arguments against compulsory education and its role as a change agent. The first group believed that education changes society for the betterment of all while the other group called it a place of "compulsory miseducation" and "factories for failure" (Osborne, 2008, p. 23). He further highlighted that the schools and compulsory education is used as an effective tool to promote ideologies of a varied number of groups. For example, "a stabilizing force"; for liberals, "utopia"; for the socialists, "dissolving the false consciousness"; for child advocates, "children protected from exploitation"; for the religious right, "teach the truths of revealed religion"; for secularists, "undermine the foundations of religious faith"; for the feminists, "biases of schooling"; for the internationalists and pacifists, "saw things differently" and for educationists, "embrace the new student-centered approaches" (p. 28). It shows that SC can be applied in all those ways, i.e., it can be a liberating concept when it reinforces understanding and investigation of one's realities or a limiting concept when it suggests conformity.

An education system is an important tool used by a state to support its school-going children and adolescents to acquire and accumulate their SC. Muslim-majority countries, such as Pakistan have used pedagogical social technologies to support pupils' accumulation of SC, be it the Madrassa (religious school) or the state-established or recognized formal schools. The tools of writing, printing and recording were used to "objectified spiritual capital in the form of manuscripts, books or cassette tapes" (Farquhar, 2016, p. 16). Pakistan has produced language textbooks for pupils to support them in learning English and Urdu languages, the core subjects, and also gather SC through the textbook content. The Islamist political parties with the support of Saudi petrodollars and USA dollars established many madrassas in the country and became an influential group that shaped the education policy and the textbook content in Pakistan which is also called 'Islamizing of education and textbooks' project and the school's co-curricular and curricular activities (Farquhar, 2016). This development spurred by the military rule with the backing of the Islamist political parties resulted in redefining SC, from a somewhat liberal to a conservative, and fundamentalist Islamist ideology. For example, the

females appearing on television were forced to cover their heads and wear 'hijab,' be it the newscasters or women appearing in different entertainment shows prepared for children and adults. The greetings and dresses also changed, the Urdu version of goodbye changed from Khuda Hafiz (Khuda is a Persian word for God) to Allah Hafiz (Allah is the Arabic word for God), men and women were discouraged from wearing Western dresses (wear local dress, shalwar kameez); and for all manners of appreciation, people were encouraged to use the Arabic words such as Masha Allah, Jazak Allah, Subhan Allah rather than the Urdu forms of 'shukria' (English translation: Thank you), and 'Khuda barkat day' (English translation: God bless you) etc. Moreover, the state made it mandatory for state-run secondary and higher secondary schools and colleges to begin their day with a recitation from the Holy Koran and a Naat (a poem praising Prophet Muhammad). The state education institutes were encouraged to hold religious festivals in schools, such as Milad (to celebrate the Birth of Prophet Muhammad) during the month of Rabi' al-Awwal, the third month in the Islamic calendar, close education institutes for Friday prayers and also observe fasting during the month of Ramadan. Now it is rigidly followed in all public and private educational institutes (Ashraf, 2018; Datto, 2014; Shah, Waris, & Basit, 2016; Shakil & Akhtar, 2012; ur Rehman & Khan, 2018).

The first education policy was envisaged with the Islamic ideology presented to the participants attending the first Educational Conference held in 1947. The first Minister of Education of Pakistan presented an outline of the education policies and system, embedded in Islam. According to him, it was the only religion that emphasised education more than other religions and Pakistan should discard the education system developed by the British because it did not have an Islamic orientation and did not cater to the needs of the Muslims and was not aligned with the ideology of the newly formed state of Pakistan (Faizi, Bibi, & Khan, 2020; Shakil & Akhtar, 2012). The Islam-focused education emphasis continued to be seen in the latest education and curriculum policies and documents. The early years of the first elected government of Pakistan, also saw the approval of a document, called The Objective Resolution, which later became the core of all important documents, such as the constitution, education policy, curriculum and textbooks. This resolution was presented to the first constituent assembly of Pakistan, after the sudden death of Muhammad Ali Jinnah in 1948, and got approved despite objections, resistance and fear from the opposition members and members belonging to religious minorities such as Hindus and Christians sitting on treasury benches. This document envisioned Pakistan as an Islamic state and all its systems and structures founded on Islamic teachings, principles, and values (Abbasi & ul Islam, 2014).

English and Urdu Language Curriculum Documents (EULCD)

The EULCD were prepared in 2006 to guide and supervise the implementation of education policies and also to support all stakeholders, teachers, pupils, parents, school administration and state education authorities in their work in different roles, direct teaching (teachers) and monitoring (school administration and state education authorities) and indirect monitoring (parents) of the implementation of the education and curriculum policies. These documents though should have been focusing on linguistic skills such as communicative competencies (reading, writing, listening and speaking) but another element was also added to these documents. This was called, "Competency 5: Appropriate Ethical and Social Development" and suggested to the textbook writers to choose texts to instill "appropriate values and attributes" (GoP, 2006a, p. 37). The EULCD writers presented their argument to the readers of these documents saying that "textbook content should provide to the readers the realistic and diverse experiences to develop their personal worldview" and "inculcate ethical and social attributes, and values relevant in a multicultural society" (GoP, 2009, p. 9). The stress on these values also showed two forces working side by side, Islamic SC and globalized SC, showing the desire of the EULCD writers, whereby, on the one hand, they wished to see pupils develop a multicultural, multi-religious, multi-ethnic perspective (a global SC) while on the other hand, they also aimed to promote worldview and societal values rooted in conservative Islam, and Islamic SC. The EULCD named three benchmarks under Competency 5: Appropriate Ethical and Social Development, which are as follows:

Benchmark 1: Recognize and practice values and attributes such as tolerance, humanism, patience, equity, justice, honesty, empathy, etc., relevant for peaceful coexistence between individuals, groups, and nations.

Benchmark II: Develop and portray through actions, a sense of importance of individual

worth; simultaneously valuing diversity and equality among people.

Benchmark III: Understand and evaluate contemporary social, economic and scientific developments/issues so as to participate in the global society as aware and thinking individuals (GoP, 2006a, p. 18)

The English and Urdu curriculum documents and textbooks are not only replete with Islamic references but there are innumerable instances of conflict between a conservative and an enlightened Islam. The former has always succeeded in overpowering the latter, resulting in a narrow interpretation and understanding of Islamic teachings and practices. The textbook content is focused on promoting conservative Islamic values as opposed to Competency 5 which

focuses on enlightened Islamic values. The change in focus in textbook content is connected with the textbook authorities' structure which is composed of individuals (textbook writers, reviewers and approvers) having a predisposition to establishing a conservative Islamic society in Pakistan. Another evidence of this unidimensional focus is the introduction of Nazra, that is the recitation of the Koran, which has been made mandatory for students of all religious beliefs. The non-Muslim students are not offered an alternative similar to Muslim students where non-Muslims students could also read their own holy books. Everyone enrolled in a school, without exception, is forced to study English and Urdu subjects as a certain percentage of the total marks for promotion to the next grade depends on achieving a passing grade in this subject. Though the EULCD curriculum documents should have been focused only on linguistic skills, such as reading, writing, listening comprehension and speaking, but these documents also underlined the importance of schooling to enrich pupils' SC through stories in language textbooks (GoP, 2006a, 2006b, 2022).

Research Methodology

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework used for this study is extracted from two ideas, first religion, which according to (Vitell et al., 2016) "tends to indicate a belief in a particular faith system, whereas spirituality involves the values, ideals, and virtues to which one is committed" (p. 148). Second, spirituality "encompasses the beliefs related to one's subjective perception concerning his/her relationships" (Vasconcelos, 2020, p. 119). The SC for this study is considered as what is made up of a "sacred or transcendent dimension of existence" (Vasconcelos, 2020, p. 119), which covers aspects such as how one views oneself, others, the community, the society and the world and the moral values guided and shaped because of this understanding about oneself and one's world. The language textbooks contain stories transmitting sacred, virtues and values that lead pupils to understand the ultimate reality, about themselves, their existence and their world. It is argued that developing pupils' SC will in turn be "opening it to the most subtle and deepest aspects" (Lozano & Ribera, 2004, p. 178) of SC through assimilation of virtues and values of higher order.

The social constructivist paradigm is very helpful in understanding the construction and amassing of SC because it happens in socially located settings and pupils construct and accumulate their SC through their interaction with the educational material (Creswell & Poth, 2016). This paradigm also offered an opportunity for the author to walk with the research participants into their reality, constructed, interpreted and founded on the world presented to them in textbooks and how this representation contributed

to the construction of the world around them and their SC. The social constructivist paradigm also requires an understanding of the SC constructed and accumulated by pupils after reading different stories in their English and Urdu textbooks and for this semi-structured interview strategy was employed to collect data. The purpose of this strategy was to collect information from pupils about their SC and triangulate it with the SC found in the textbook to find out the extent to which pupils' SC is rooted in and shaped by the textbooks. A Focus Group is considered an effective method to collect data using a semi-structured interview strategy because the settings are similar to the individual interview but a little different from it because of the element of getting influenced by other participants or influencing group members, similar to pupils' everyday lives (Krueger & Casey, 2015). The researchers have been using it because they have found out the "essential purpose of focus group research," which is "to identify a range of perspectives on a research topic and to gain an understanding of the issues from the perspective of the participants themselves" (Hennink, 2014, p. 2).

Research Method

This study is rooted in the qualitative interpretivist/constructivist research paradigm and it is argued that qualitative research "provides an in-depth, intricate and detailed understanding of meanings, actions, non-observable as well as observable phenomena, attitudes, intentions and behaviours" (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2018, p. 288). Qualitative research deals with data that is "socially situated, context-related, context-dependent and context-rich" (Cohen et al., 2018, p. 288) and the job of the researcher is to "understand, describe and explain the multiple" (Cohen et al., 2018, p. 288) aspects of the data, highlighted during the analysis and description of data. This study used the qualitative textbook content analysis method to analyse textbook content and explore different messages received and communicated through the stories found in textbooks that contributed to generating pupils' SC. The qualitative content analysis also allowed the author to engage in the description of the SC and interpret it through wide-angle lenses with an interest in emancipation from oppression, exploitation, inequality, power and powerlessness, and un-freedoms (Fuchs, 2010).

The pupils in grade 8 were selected using a convenient sampling strategy and it was decided by the author to invite only those pupils to participate in Focus Groups Discussions (FGD) who were willing to share and speak in small groups (Kress & Shoffner, 2007; Prasad & Garcia, 2017). Five groups of pupils, from five different lower-income private schools, were selected and each group comprised 10 pupils. The author approached public schools but they refused to allow the author

to conduct this activity with their pupils fearing that this might cause a problem for their school and result in the issuance of a show-cause notice from the local educational administration. The lower-income schools were selected because the pupils studying in these schools have been studying the textbooks published by the provincial textbook authorities from their early years. The private schools targeting the middle-class and upper-middle-class segments of society used English and Urdu textbooks published by the private textbook publisher, Oxford University Press, a major private textbook publisher in Pakistan for private schools.

The semi-structured interview with each group was conducted in two sessions, each session lasting for one hour with a refreshment break of 10 minutes between the first and the second session. The first session started with a short introduction of each participant and the participants were allowed to choose the information about themselves that they would like to share with their peers. One reason to select grade 8 pupils was that they have been reading the educational material, that is, textbooks, published by the state textbook authorities from their early years and they have grown up reading the textbooks published by the state textbook authorities, from four to grade eight. The other reason was that they were able to organize and share their thoughts and feelings with other pupils. The conversation in the groups was shaped by the guided questions given to pupils at the beginning of the session, after the introduction round, the following guided questions were asked during the conversation:

1. What are the virtues/characteristics of an ideal human being?
2. What are the virtues/characteristics of a political leader and a ruler?
3. What are the family virtues/characteristics?

The author intentionally did not use the word SC believing that it might frighten pupils into thinking that the author was asking questions about their concept of religiosity, piety and their belief in the core religious teachings. The author was aware that any such conversation where a participant or participants might speak of their faith that another participant might find offensive would result in consequences which would result in harming the lives and properties of pupils and the participating schools, their teachers and administration. There have been incidents where schools, teachers and pupils' lives have been threatened due to a complaint by a pupil alleging that a teacher or pupil has said or done something considered offensive and derogatory to Prophet Muhammad and Islam.

Limitations of the Author

It was thought that an ideal focus group should comprise an equal number of male and female participants and also participants belonging to different faith groups. Though the focus groups had a few female participants the pupils from minority faiths refused to participate in this activity. The author can understand their reason for refusing to participate in this research. They thought that anything they say can be misunderstood and misquoted by some participants from the majority faith and it would trigger the old vicious cycle of violence against religious minorities, which in the past has resulted in the loss of life, property and businesses of members from minority communities. The pupils who participated in the FGD activity were Muslims, belonging to the majority group, Sunni Muslims.

Why English and Urdu Language Textbooks

English and Urdu from grades 1 to 12 are core subjects, and 70% of the pupils study the textbooks published by the state-mandated curriculum and textbook authorities. This study analyzed textbooks published by the three state textbook authorities, Punjab (PCTB), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KpKTB), and Sindh (STB). The total number of textbooks analyzed in this study was 24 (12 English and 12 Urdu textbooks). The pupils have been studying the language textbooks published by the provincial textbook authorities throughout their schooling years, during their primary and elementary schooling years.

Findings and Discussion

Textbook: Islam and SC

Virtues as an Ideal Human Being: Tolerance, Charity, and Acceptance of non-Muslims

The virtue of tolerance and acceptance of non-Muslims is highlighted in many stories in English and Urdu textbooks. All textbooks analyzed in this study began with a story about Prophet Muhammad and the focus of the stories was to highlight and emphasize the virtue of acceptance and tolerance shown to non-Muslims by Prophet Muhammad and His companion and also by Muslims in the contemporary world. The story narrated in many textbooks from Prophet Muhammad's life is of a non-Muslim woman who hated him so much that she would throw rubbish at him whenever he passed that street. Prophet Muhammad realized that the woman had not thrown rubbish at him for a few days, he was worried about her and went to her house and found out that the woman was sick. Prophet Muhammad cleaned her house, did other domestic chores and asked her to call him whenever she needed him. The highlight of this incident was the commentary added to the story

by the textbook writer stating that "Islam made it obligatory for all Muslims to care about the well-being of their neighbours" (PCTB, 2020, p. 44).

The textbooks highlighted the virtues practised by Prophet Muhammad's close associates, one of them was his son-in-law and the third Muslim ruler after Prophet Muhammad's death, Usman, a rich merchant who converted to Islam and married to Prophet Muhammad's daughter. A story is narrated about him where he bought a well from a Jew who would not let poor Muslims use that well. Usman bought the well from the Jew and gave it to the people, Muslims and non-Muslims, (KpKTB, 2020c, p. 17). The point the textbook writers and approvers wanted to highlight was the transformation, he became kind, tolerant, compassionate and merciful, which occurred in Usman after his conversion to Islam and accepting Prophet Muhammad as the true and only prophet. The textbook had multiple stories about other early Muslim rulers, Prophet Muhammad's associates before they became rulers and how their companionship and friendship with Prophet Muhammad brought about positive changes in them, transforming them into merciful and tolerant towards all, Muslims and non-Muslims. This story also concluded with the lesson for non-Muslims that the "Prophet has declared that every Muslim must look after the sick and also Islam believes in peaceful coexistence and emphasizes on forgiving" (KpKTB, 2020b, p. 101)

The textbook authorities also wanted to present to pupils that these virtues were still practised by Muslims and for this, they included many stories, one of the stories was "The Devoted Mate" (KpKTB, 2020b, pp. 98-101). This story told how a Muslim young man went to a non-Muslim country (Europe) and there he was discriminated against by his non-Muslim classmates who made fun of him, his appearance, his beard, his dress, his religion and religious practices such as praying five times a day, fasting, not eating certain food items etc. The young Muslim man did not respond to these abuses and stayed quiet and composed. One day he found out that the leader of the group who used to mock him was sick and he did not have anyone to look after him because his father was away from home. He went to that young man's house and looked after him, cooked food, cleaned the house, washed dishes and did laundry till the young man had fully recovered and his father had returned home. The non-Muslim young man and his father were grateful to the Muslim man and appreciated him. What is important in this story is that the writer of this story highlighted the belief system of the Muslim young man because he continued to remind himself that Prophet Muhammad also suffered like this but HE never reacted and the young man promised to himself that he would follow the follow Prophet Muhammad's example.

Virtues as an Ideal Ruler: Compassion, Mercy, and Forgiveness

The textbooks also narrated stories about Prophet Muhammad as a leader of Muslims and as a ruler of the first Islamic state and his companions who ruled the Islamic state after Prophet Muhammad's death. The stories recounted Prophet Muhammad's life in Mecca as a continuous struggle of good against evil and Muslims against non-Muslims. The Islamic SC of an ideal Muslim state and an ideal Muslim ruler is conceptualized and presented to pupils through these stories and strongly knitted together through the virtues of mercy and compassion of the ruler towards the weak, poor and disadvantaged groups. The textbook writers presented stories where Muslim rulers were dispensing justice and a story about Umer, the second ruler who ruled the first Muslim state after Prophet Muhammad's death showed compassion, courage and intelligence while he was listening to a case presented before him (STB, 2020a, pp. 8-11). A young Muslim man was convicted of murder during Umer's rule and he asked Umer to be released on parole to pay back his father's loan to the lender, a Jew. He was released on parole when another friend of Prophet Muhammad became his guarantor and this young man returned as he promised and presented himself before Umer. There is another story where a non-Muslim, convicted of a crime, took advantage of the leniency shown to him by the Muslim ruler. These two stories present two similar situations but the characters are shown possessing opposite characteristics, simplicity versus a conniving attitude. Another story quoted Prophet Muhammad saying, also called Hadith in Islam, 'by Allah, if Fatima, daughter of Prophet Muhammad, were to steal, I would have her hand cut off.'

The SC of a Muslim ruler or a Muslim state is also presented in the stories recounting how early Muslim rulers looked after the socially and financially disadvantaged groups. One of the stories recounted how Prophet Muhammad and his successors went out to the streets at night to see if anyone was sleeping in the streets, or was hungry or sick and if they found anyone, they provided food and looked after the sick and the old. One of the stories, attributed the saying, 'if a dog dies hungry on the banks of the River Euphrates, Umar will be responsible for dereliction of duty to him,' to Umar, the second ruler of the Islamic state. The stories about all first four rulers who succeeded Prophet Muhammad are included in English and Urdu textbooks and these contained SC that the textbook authorities wanted to promote and develop amongst pupils believing that many of them would become future leaders who might be running the state in different roles, politicians, administrators and bureaucrats. One of his companions Abu Sufian, Prophet Muhammad's first cousin, his foster brother

and early followers did not like Prophet Muhammad helping slaves and people who belonged to the lower socioeconomic class. He rebuked Prophet Muhammad by saying, "it does not suit you to carry things for the poor and low people" and Prophet Muhammad responded to him by saying, "I am the grandson of Hashim who served the rich and the poor alike and never hated the low" (KpKTB, 2020a, p. 3). This story presented the message of Islam and SC of Muslims, that is, helping others irrespective of who the other person is, his/her faith and socio-economic status, believing that all human beings are created by Allah/God and they are equal, in this temporary world and the eternal world.

Virtue as a Family Member: Father, Husband, and Slave Owner

The stories presented Prophet Muhammad as a kind, generous and caring husband, father and friend, and Prophet Muhammad is presented as an ideal husband and father in the story of Prophet Muhammad's first wife, Khadija. She liked him as her employer due to his honesty and hard work and later she married him and Prophet Muhammad stayed with her till her death. She saw him as a gentle husband, a caring father, a faithful life partner, an honest employee and later a trustworthy owner and trustee of her business. There is another message in this story which highlighted Prophet Muhammad's dedication to his first wife, highlighting that he only married Sawdah bint Zam'ah, the second wife of Prophet Muhammad whom he married after Khadija's death. A textbook writer while writing a biography of Khadija, the first wife of Prophet Muhammad, concluded the biography with a sentence that "she [Hazrat Khadija (SA)] is an example for Muslim women as she leads an exemplary life as a wife, as a companion and a friend of Prophet Muhammad. Every Muslim woman who would live a life like Khadija has a successful life in this world and the life after" (STB, 2020b, p. 12). The textbooks have stories narrating Prophet Muhammad's family life through his two wives, Khadija and Aisha and his daughter, Fatima and these stories informed pupils about the SC of a Muslim man as a husband and a father

Prophet Muhammad is shown as kind and gentle not only to his wives and children but also to those who worked for him, his slaves. There are stories in the textbook narrating how Prophet Muhammad treated slaves, his slaves and slaves owned by other [non-Muslims] and how he helped them. One of the stories stated that a non-Muslim owned a slave and he treated him poorly and would not feed him well. The slave got sick and Prophet Muhammad happened to pass by that road and saw the slave tired and lying on the road, he took pity on him and asked him to take some rest while Prophet Muhammad did his work. After

completing the work, he asked the slave to remember him whenever he needed him to complete the work assigned by his master. There is another story with a similar message where an old slave was assigned the task of fetching water from a well located far away from the house of the slave owner. When Prophet Muhammad saw the old slave fetching water, he carried the water for the slave from the well to the house and then asked him to "remember him and call him whenever you need me" (KpKTB, 2020a, p. 3). These stories also communicated to pupils the Islamic perspective of the rights of labourers and workers, looking after them well, paying them well and not assigning them work beyond their physical capability.

Results of Semi-Structured Interview, Pupils' SC, and Textbooks

Virtues as an Ideal Human Being: Tolerance, Charity, and Acceptance of non-Muslims

The pupils while answering the guided questions in FGD sessions said that they were tolerant and open-minded because they learned from their textbooks how Prophet Muhammad lived his life and how he interacted with non-Muslims. The pupils believed that tolerance of people of other faiths is an important part of their. The pupils while explaining it mentioned incidents from textbooks where Prophet Muhammad had shown mercy and compassion to non-Muslims. They quoted the incident of the old woman because this incident is repeated in many English and Urdu textbooks from classes four to eight. The examples from textbooks were quoted by pupils when they described how they should live their lives. The female pupils in groups shared how they should live in their families, how they should behave, dress and support their families. They understood from the textbook stories that their lives should be shaped around men (father, brother and later husband) in their families and it is the core of the values cultivated through the textbooks.

Virtues as an Ideal Ruler: Compassion, Mercy, and Forgiveness

The most often repeated phrase in the FGD was 'Muslim rulers not only introduced the concept of a welfare state but also established the very first welfare state in the world' [focus group participants], this showed the SC communicated to pupils through the stories of Muslim rulers, be it Prophet Muhammad or his companion or other Muslim rulers. The participants of the FGD repeated the claim made in different stories in language and history textbooks that 'the people living in lands ruled by Christian and Persian kings converted to Islam because they found the message of Islam containing the elements of a society built on justice and equality, [which was] not practised by their former Christian and Persian rulers' [focus

group participants]. The female participants agreed with what the male participants said but they also stressed the role of the Muslim women who supported their husbands, fathers and brothers to become good Muslim rulers and contributed in different ways to establishing a Muslim welfare state. The male students spoke more on this focussed question as compared to female participants and male participants spoke about Muslim rulers and characteristics that Muslim rulers possessed in the past and should possess in today's world representing the true Islamic SC of a Muslim ruler, its bureaucracy and a Muslim state.

Virtue as a Family Member: Father and Husband, Brother, and Slave Owner

The participants spent most of the time talking about how a Muslim should live his/her life, and how he/she should live at home and in a community or a society. The pupils gave many examples from stories they read in textbooks where Prophet Muhammad was shown interacting with his wife and daughters. The pupils believed that Prophet Muhammad was an ideal husband and father, but when probed further about the situation in their homes, where their fathers and brother did not support their mothers and sisters in different household chores, such as cleaning, cooking, washing and laundry, the male pupils were reluctant to talk about it. They were critical of this probing question explaining that it is all due to cultural differences and they argued that their fathers helped their mothers by doing the chores which required going out, such as paying utility bills and grocery shopping. The female pupils thought that men whether their fathers or brothers should open themselves to supporting the women at home and supporting them in the household chores because many women have now taken up full-time and part-time jobs. The female pupils gave examples from the English and Urdu texts where women were shown working in fields along with men and they also worked at home doing different chores, such as cleaning, cooking, laundry, washing, looking after children and other family members of their husbands, such as mother-in-law, father-in-law and unmarried brothers and sisters of their husbands. The female pupils were of the view that men do not follow Prophet Muhammad's example and found cultural practices as an excuse. There was an interesting discussion on gender roles and representation but the space here did not allow the author to explore this any further.

Conclusion

The semi-structured FGD showed that pupils' SC is constructed from and shaped by the stories found in English and Urdu textbooks. The SC deposited and communicated to pupils in the textbook stories constructed SC that encompassed areas such as personal, family, community and citizenship. The

pupils while describing their SC always quoted stories and incidents narrated in the textbooks about Prophet Muhammad, his family, his friends and Muslim rulers. The dependence of pupils on religious biographies and stories showed that the state through its textbook authorities ensured that pupils' SC is rooted in Islam and founded in Islamic teaching. The conversations also showed that pupils' perspective of living a good/spiritual life and religious/spiritual lifestyle was shaped by the stories found in language textbooks. The pupils' understanding of tolerance and acceptance of others is embedded in the Islamic concept of diversity which lacked the modern concept of inclusion and diversity. The Islamic concept of diversity employed religion as the only indicator that distinguishes one group from other groups and Islam identified and grouped people from its early history into Muslims and infidels, later 'people of the book' term was also used to make the first Islamic state look inclusive and included Christians, Jews and Zoroastrians as people of the book. Linguistic and ethnic diversity is not considered important traits that shape groups and their SC. This is also evident from the education policy documents that always consider pupils as Muslims (read Sunni) and did not recognize Shia and other Muslim minority groups within Islam as distinct and possessing a unique SC but clubbed them together as Muslims.

The non-Muslims were invisible in the education policy and curriculum documents and plans which was manifested in the new education policy that made Nazra a core subject for Muslims but did not lay out an alternative for non-Muslim pupils. This study also found that the textbooks excluded non-Muslims from the stories and for this reason, it was decided that the FGD would not include non-Muslims in this exercise. This study could not predict how non-Muslim pupils construct and accumulate their SC. The data analyzed were from Muslim pupils and it was also considered that the FGD would not ask questions focusing specifically on these two main Muslim groups, Shias and Sunnis rather focus on SC of a Muslim. The textbook content revealed a lack of representation of non-Muslim characters in stories portraying non-Muslims as not having any personalities possessing such characteristics attributed to Prophet Muhammad, HIS family friends, and associates. The pupils did not mention any non-Muslim character and personality that might have contributed to shaping their SC because they only read about non-Muslims as enemies of Islam and Muslims, bearing no influence on Islamic SC.

Education and SC became intertwined in Pakistan and the state used education as a tool to promote a certain SC to be constructed and accumulated by pupils. The state also announced a certain set of practices/rituals to be practised in schools such as Islamic school prayer before starting school and

closing school early on Friday, giving pupils and teachers time to attend Friday prayer in the nearby mosque. The schools and local education authorities were told to conduct Koran recitation and Naat (poetry in praise of Prophet Muhammad, popular in South Asia) competitions at the regional (tehsil and district), provincial and national levels and these events were promoted in the 1980s and 1990s during the Islamization of education (GoP, 1992, 1998) years. The changes brought in the curriculum and textbooks were meant to transform pupils into pious Muslims who had accumulated Islamic SC over the number of years they spent in school through reading the stories about Islam, its history, expansion, teachings, Prophet Muhammad, his family and companions' life stories. The state Islamized the physical spaces in schools by allocating spaces for prayer (for Muslim pupils), school rituals such as Koran recitation before starting school assembly and school events, celebrating Muslim holidays in schools and Islamizing the celebrations of the patriotic and national days. These policies and practices were initiated and reinforced to create a set of Islamic SC, present to pupils through all school activities, teaching and non-teaching, to construct and accumulate SC.

The FGD discussions also exhibited the successful employment of textbooks as a tool to inculcate and shape a certain SC amongst pupils, giving it a certain outlook of SC. The pupils stressed having Islam and Islamic teachings as the foundation of their SC. This also showed the state's intent of developing and cultivating a homogeneous SC of pupils with a uniform foundation of SC and its standardized effects on pupils' behaviours in different social, cultural and religious settings, in different roles in family, community and society at large. The pupils also refused to accept the influence of culture on their SC and said that Islamic culture is the only culture that should have any influence on their SC.

The FGD also explored pupils' relationships and interactions with non-Muslim Pakistanis and people from other countries to investigate their SC and how it shapes their outlook about their non-Muslim country fellows and people of the world, living in different countries. The discussion was interesting because they continued to bring Islam and Islamic teaching into the discussion suggesting that Prophet Muhammad treated the non-Muslims well when he established the very first Islamic kingdom so respecting other faiths is the core of their SC because it is reinforced in Koran and Hadith multiple times. There was not a single pupil who was ready to accept the fact that Muslims ever discriminated against non-Muslims but all of them believed that Islam was the only religion that taught its followers to respect other religions. They quoted examples from Muslim rulers such as Sal-ud-din, who fought with the Christian rulers to

take back Jerusalem and saved one of the most important sites, a story from their History textbook. These views are similar to what is found in the history textbooks narrating the stories about the Crusades. Muslims treated the local population well and they converted to Islam after experiencing the differences between how their earlier rulers treated them and how their new rulers (Muslims) treated them and this reflection persuaded the local population to convert to Islam. These historical narratives had an opposite representation of the Christians stating that they killed the local population and discriminated against them in their conquests of Jerusalem. When told that the majority of the population was Christian during that time, the pupils refused to believe this and said that the majority were infidels and some were Jews and Christians, revealing a strong influence of textbook narratives on pupils SC.

The FGD discovered not only the narrow focus of pupils' SC but also the lack of influence of regional and international events on their SC. The pupils were very vocal about the mistreatment of Muslims at the hands of non-Muslims (Kashmir, Palestine issue and treatment of Muslims in the West) but they refused to accept that Muslim-majority countries are mistreating the religious minorities living there. It was also interesting to note that they did not know anything about the treatment of Uighur Muslims and how they were treated by the Chinese state and its authorities. The facts reported in reputed media outlets failed to convince them and they said that it was the West's (read Christian and Jewish) propaganda to malign Islam, Muslims and Islamic teachings. The pupils believed that "China is a country where the state does not enforce any religion onto its people and people can choose and live their lives as they wish and desire" (quotation from the FDG). When the author presented facts about attacks on non-Muslims in Pakistan, loss of life, property and religious workshop places, the students always called it a plot by the anti-Islam forces to malign Islam and Islamic teachings through the hired hooligans who knew nothing about Islam, its history, teaching on how to live as a Muslim and tolerance of non-Muslims, an important component of this belief system.

The study found that pupils' SC remained rooted in religion (Islam) and their social constructions of their SC is derived from the stories given in textbooks, about Islam, early Islamic history and Muslim personalities. The educational material (textbooks) not only contributed to the construction of SC but also making pupils SC an exclusive SC, making it hard for pupils to realign their SC by incorporating the global aspects especially, the acceptance of differences (religion, language, ethnicity and nationality). The pupils' construction of their SC from the textbook also reflected their selective approach to constructing SC by accepting the stories presented in the textbooks

but unwilling to accept stories which were not part of the textbooks and the formal educational system. The pupils' social constructions of a pious and an evil human being, an ideal and obedient son or a daughter, a good husband and a pious wife, and different social aspects of their lives were similar to the stories they read in the textbooks. The textbooks not only contributed in constructing pupils' exclusive SC, focusing on ritualistic SC but also making it difficult to accept any aspect found in non-Islamic sources and non-Muslim societies. The disposition to inclusive or a global SC was non-existent amongst pupils' and this was evident from the FGD sessions.

Recommendations

This study showed a direct link between pupils' SC and the language textbooks and the use of textbooks as an effective tool to cultivate and nurture a certain SC of pupils. The FGD uncovered another aspect of pupils' SC, that is, though pupils' SC is rooted in Islam, Islamic personalities and Islamic teachings it lacked holistic ideals of SC. The textbook authorities chose to ignore the real world, which is multicultural and multireligious and decided to focus on a narrow Islamic concept of SC and promoted conservative Islam and its SC at the expense of a global digitally connected world. It is suggested that textbooks should present to pupils stories reflecting a multicultural and multireligious Pakistan and the world reinforcing the global values of openness, inclusivity, acceptance, and equality. The textbook authorities claim that they are open to making the school curricula inclusive contributing to the construction of inclusive and global SC but their concept of global SC is very narrow, rooted in conservative Islam and they consider the other sources of SC (multireligious, multicultural and pluralistic) invalid. The textbook authorities also need to expand their concept of SC and make global values an important part of pupils' SC, considering other sources of SC as worthwhile sources as Islamic sources to support pupils' constructions of SC. If the authorities do not change their concept of SC and expand their choices of sources to construct pupils' SC then this will result in making pupils incompetent to integrate in global world practicing global SC.

References

- Abbasi, M. A., & ul Islam, M. (2014). Islamization in Pakistan: A need to focus on promoting a tolerant society. *Journal of Islam in Asia*, 11(1), 209-209.
- Ashraf, M. A. (2018). Islamized Ideologies in the Pakistani Education System: The Need for Religious Literacy. *Religious Education*, 113(1), 3-13.
- Barker, M. (2007). Investments in religious capital: An explorative case study of Australian Buddhists. *Journal of Global Buddhism*, 8, 65-80.
- Boettke, P. J. (2010). Spiritual Capital and Economic Development: An Overview. In P. L. Berger & G. Redding (Eds.), *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress* (pp. 29-40). London: Anthem Press.
- Borup, J. (2019). Spiritual Capital and religious evolution: Buddhist values and transactions in historical and contemporary perspective. *Journal of Global Buddhism*, 20, 49-69. doi:10.5281/zenodo.3238217
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. G. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (pp. 241-258). New York: Greenwood Press.
- Braudel, F. (1992). *Civilization and capitalism, 15th-18th century, vol. II: The wheels of commerce*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Budiasni, N. W. N., Ayuni, N. M. S., & Trisnadewi, N. K. A. (2019). The implementation of spiritual capital Saab Mote Craftsmen: Study of the Hindu teachings (study of Saab Mote craftsman in Nagasepaha village, Buleleng). *International Journal of Social Science and Business*, 3(3), 336-340.
- Cannan, E. (1921). Early History of the Term Capital. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 35(3), 469-481.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). *Research methods in education* (8th ed.). New York: Routledge.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. New York: Sage.
- Dattoo, A.-K. (2014). *Predominant narratives shaping education in Pakistan: Historical and sociological perspectives*. Paper presented at the Revue internationale d'éducation de Sèvres, Paris.
- Dsouli, O., Khan, N., & Kakabadse, N. K. (2012). Spiritual capital: The co-evolution of an ethical framework based on Abrahamic religious values in the Islamic tradition *Journal of Management Development*, 31(10), 1058-1076. doi:10.1108/02621711211281843
- Faizi, W., Bibi, W., & Khan, F. (2020). Educational policies (1947-2009) of Pakistan and integration of Islamic values among secondary level learners: an evaluative study. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities & Social Sciences Research*, 3(01), 79-90.

- Farquhar, M. (2016). *Circuits of faith: Migration, education, and the Wahhabi mission*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Fetter, F. A. (1927). Clark's reformulation of the capital concept. In J. H. Hollander (Ed.), *Economic Essays Contributed in Honor of John Bates Clark* (pp. 136–156). New York: Macmillan.
- Finke, R. (2003). *Spiritual capital: Definitions, applications, and new frontiers*. Paper presented at the Spiritual Capital Planning Meeting.
- Fisher, I. (1896). What is capital? *Economic Journal*, 6(4), 509-534.
- Fisher, I. (1904). Precedents for defining capital. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 18(3), 386-408.
- Fitzgibbon, A. *The importance of spiritual capital within human development in Islamic teaching*. Retrieved from <http://policy.islamic-relief.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/Spiritual-Capital.pdf>
- Fuchs, E. (2010). Introduction: Contextualizing school textbook revision. *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society*, 2(2), 1-12.
- Fukuyama, F. (2001). Culture and economic development: Cultural concerns. In N. J. Smelser & P. B. Baltes (Eds.), *International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences*. (pp. 3130–3134). Oxford, UK: Pergamon.
- Fuller, B. (2009). A sociology of spirituality. *Sociology of Religion*, 70(2), 197-198.
- Golparvar, M., Darayi, N., & Khayyatan, F. (2015). Construct of Islamic spiritual capital and spiritual wellbeing short-form scales. *Religious Anthropology*, 11(32), 167-188.
- GoP. (1992). *National education policy 1992*. Islamabad: GoP.
- GoP. (1998). *National education policy (1998-2010)*. Islamabad: GoP.
- GoP. (2006a). *National curriculum for English language grades I-XII*. Islamabad: GoP.
- GoP. (2006b). *National curriculum for Urdu (compulsory) grades I-XII*. Islamabad: GoP.
- GoP. (2009). *National Education Policy 2009*. Islamabad: GoP.
- GoP. (2022). *Single National Curriculum 2022*. Islamabad: GoP.
- Gràcia, C. (2012). Spiritual capital. The new border to cross. *Ramon Llull Journal of Applied Ethics*, 3(3), 115-134.
- Hardie, C. (2018). *Tibetan Buddhist spiritual capital in contemporary China*. (Doctoral thesis), University of Oxford, Oxford, UK.
- Hefner, R. W. (2010). Islam and spiritual capital: An Indonesian case study. In P. L. Berger & G. Redding (Eds.), *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress* (pp. 191-212). London: Anthem Press.
- Hennink, M. M. (2014). *Focus group discussions: Understanding qualitative research*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Keller, J. G., & Helfenbein, R. (2008). Spirituality, economics, and education: A dialogic critique of "Spiritual Capital". *Nebula*, 5(3), 109-128.
- KpKTB. (2020a). *English 6*. Peshawar: KpKTB.
- KpKTB. (2020b). *English 8*. Peshawar: KpKTB.
- KpKTB. (2020c). *Urdu 8*. Peshawar: KpKTB.
- Kress, V. E., & Shoffner, M. F. (2007). Focus groups: A practical and applied research approach for counselors. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 85(2), 189-195.
- Krueger, R. A., & Casey, M. A. (2015). *Focus groups: A practical guide for applied research* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Landes, D. (2000). Culture makes all the difference. In L. E. Harrison & S. P. Huntington (Eds.), *Culture Matters: How Values Shape Human Progress* (pp. 2-13). Basic Books: New York.
- Limacher, K. (2019). Bhangra, Bhajan, Bollywood—religious knowledge among Hindu Youth in Switzerland and Austria. In K. Limacher, A. Mattes, & C. Novak (Eds.), *Prayer, Pop and Politics: Researching Religious Youth in Migration Society* (pp. 161-177). Göttingen: Vienna University Press.
- Lozano, J. M., & Ribera, R. (2004). A new chance for management—A new challenge for spirituality. In L. Zsolnai (Ed.), *Spirituality and Ethics in Management* (pp. 175-185). New York: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Lucey, T. A. (2019). Examining a measure of spiritual capital: Perceptions of business and education majors. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 18(1), 3 –15. doi:10.1177/2047173418823543

- Malloch, T. R. (2010). *Spiritual enterprise: Doing virtuous business*. New York: Encounter.
- Malloch, T. R. (2014). Chapter 24 Spiritual capital. In P. Oslington (Ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity and Economics* (pp. 463-471). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Marshall, A. (1920). *Principles of economics: An introductory volume* (8 ed.). London: Macmillan.
- Marx, K. (1976). *Capital* (Vol. 1). Harmondsworth: Pelican.
- Marx, K. (1978). *Capital* (Vol. 2). Harmondsworth: Pelican.
- Marx, K. (1981). *Capital* (Vol. 3). Harmondsworth: Pelican.
- Middlebrooks, A., & Noghiu, A. (2010). Leadership and spiritual capital: Exploring the link between individual service disposition and organizational value. *International Journal of Leadership Studies*, 6(1), 67-85.
- O'Sullivan, M., & Flanagan, B. (Eds.). (2016). *Spiritual capital: Spirituality in practice in Christian perspective*. New York: Routledge.
- Osborne, K. (2008). Education and schooling: A relationship that can never be taken for granted. In G. D. Fenstermacher (Ed.), *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education* (Vol. 107, pp. 21-41). New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Ostrom, E. (2000). Social capital: A fad or a fundamental concept? In P. Dasgupta & I. Serageldin (Eds.), *Social Capital: A Multifaceted Perspective* (pp. 172-215). Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Palmer, D. A., & Wong, M. (2013). *Clarifying the concept of spiritual capital*. Paper presented at the Conference on the Social Scientific Study of Religion, The Chinese University of Hong Kong.
- PCTB. (2020). *English 4*. Lahore, Pakistan: PCTB.
- Prasad, M., & Garcia, C. (2017). How to conduct a successful focus group discussion. *Humans of Data*. Retrieved from <https://humansofdata.atlan.com/2017/09/conduct-successful-focus-group-discussion/>
- Putnam, R. D. (1995). Bowling alone: America's declining social capital. *Journal of Democracy*, 6, 65-78.
- Rima, S. D. (2012). *Spiritual capital: A moral core for social and economic justice*. UK: Gower.
- Sardar, Z., Ryandono, M. N. H., & Ratnasari, R. T. (2018). *Implementation of spiritual capital in Islamic perspective to business performance*. Paper presented at the 2nd International Conference Postgraduate School (ICPS 2018).
- Sen, A. (1999). *Development as freedom*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Shah, A. S., Waris, M., & Basit, A. (2016). Islamization in Pakistan: A critical analysis of Zia's regime. *Global Regional Review*, 1(1), 260-270.
- Shakil, A. F., & Akhtar, S. H. (2012). Consideration of Islamic values in the educational policies of Pakistan. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 2(1), 297-297.
- STB. (2020a). *Urdu-7*. Jamshoro, Pakistan: STB.
- STB. (2020b). *Urdu-V*. Jamshoro, Pakistan: STB.
- Stokes, P., Baker, C., & Lichy, J. (2016). The role of embedded individual values, belief and attitudes and spiritual capital in shaping everyday postsecular organizational culture. *European Management Review*, 13(1), 37-51.
- Sujana, I. P. W. M., Darmawan, C., & Dasim Budimansyah, S. (2021). Civic education based on the value of Hindu spiritual culture. *NVEO*, 8(5), 10410-10418.
- Uphoff, N. (2000). Understanding social capital: Learning from the analysis and experience of participation. In P. Dasgupta & I. Serageldin (Eds.), *Social Capital: A multifaceted perspective* (pp. 215-253). Washington, DC: World Bank.
- ur Rehman, F., & Khan, H. U. (2018). The role of educational institutions in Islamization, social reformation and national integration in Pakistan. *Journal of Religious Studies*, 1(2), 16-31.
- Vasconcelos, A. F. (2020). Individual spiritual capital: Meaning, a conceptual framework and implications. *Journal of Work-Applied Management*, 13(1), 117-141. doi:10.1108/JWAM-08-2020-0038
- Vitell, S. J., King, R. A., Howie, K., Toti, J.-F., Albert, L., Hidalgo, E. R., & Yacout, O. (2016). Spirituality, moral identity, and consumer ethics: A multicultural study. *Journal of business ethics*, 139(1), 147-160. doi:10.1007/s10551-015-2626-0
- Wrong, G. M. (1924). The teaching of the history and Geography of the British Empire. *Canadian Historical Review*, 5(4), 297-313.

Zohar, D., & Marshall, I. (2004). *Spiritual capital: Wealth we can live by*. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc.